

WEST OXFORDSHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

ENVIRONMENT OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

THURSDAY 20 MARCH 2014

SERVICE REVIEW - PROVISION OF PUBLIC CONVENIENCES

REPORT OF THE HEAD OF ENVIRONMENT AND COMMERCIAL SERVICES

(Contact: Claire Locke, Tel: (01993) 861344)

(The decisions on this matter will be recommendations to Cabinet)

1. PURPOSE

To consider the findings of a public convenience service review and make recommendations to improve service provision and better manage service costs.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

That Cabinet be recommended to approve:-

- (a) Policy option A - that the Council maintain existing discretionary provision of public conveniences but do not provide or operate any additional toilet facilities unless a suitable source of funding or delivery can be identified which does not place additional pressure on existing service budgets;
- (b) The provision of baby changing facilities and Radar locks for disabled cubicles at all sites;
- (c) A policy decision on the provision of urinals and agree to either;
 - (i) maintain existing urinals and continue to make no changes to this service, or,
 - (ii) adopt a policy to maintain existing separate urinals in addition to cubicle provision, but install no further urinals and replace urinals with cubicles when they require routine replacement, or,
 - (iii) adopt a policy to remove existing urinals and where demand requires replace with cubicles.
- (d) That based on limited usage and cost, that subject to consultation with the Parish Council to close one of the Eynsham facilities to generate estimated direct revenue saving of £9,100 per year, with the potential to make additional savings on overheads in addition to building maintenance cost savings. Whilst building maintenance planned and reactive costs vary, it may be possible to achieve an average reduction in expenditure of £2714 per year. The closure of both existing facilities and replacement with one central facility, if feasible, will be considered;
- (e) That Cabinet recommend to Council that charges are increased to 20 pence per use from 1st April 2014, with charges applied at all facilities as soon as alterations can be made;
- (f) Subject to consultation with the relevant Town and Parish Councils, to reduce opening hours to 07:30 – 19:30 year round at all facilities except High Street, Burford, Guildenford Car park, Burford and Hensington Road, Woodstock which will remain open until 21.00 during the Summer to support the tourist trade; and

- (g) That Cabinet recommend to Council the approval of the one-off Capital required of up to £25,000 including contingency sum, to fund recommendations above which will generate an annual saving estimated at £27,331.

3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1. West Oxfordshire District Council has 13 public conveniences, with 12 public conveniences having a charge of 10p per use (see appendix A).
- 3.2. All toilets have accessible facilities, most of which are entered via the use of a radar key, which can be purchased at The Town Centre Shop, Witney or the Guildhall, Chipping Norton. There is a charge of £4.14 and the customer's disabled badge must be produced at the time of purchase. The only exception is Browns Lane, Woodstock which has a disabled toilet but no radar key facility.

Current service costs

- 3.3. The revenue generated from charging for 2012/2013 was £11,606 and the costs associated with running public conveniences in 2012/2013 was £165,252 which incorporates cleaning, consumables, repairs & maintenance, electric & water. The Council therefore provides a subsidy of £153,646 to support the provision of public conveniences. This includes a contract with Healthmatic Ltd for the cleaning of all 13 public conveniences, which is due for renewal in September 2014. This WODC contract currently forms part of the Cherwell framework, which provides the Council with a group discount.
- 3.4. The public convenience cleansing and maintenance contract at Cotswold District Council is also due for renewal in September 2014, so the Councils will be jointly considering procurement options to ensure best value is achieved and where possible service savings are made.

Charging

- 3.5. Charges were introduced for toilet usage in 2004/05 following a programme of refurbishment. A charge of 10 pence is currently applied to all cubicles except those at New Street, Chipping Norton. Urinals can be accessed free of charge. Whilst cost of servicing, utilities etc. has increased since 2005, the charge per use has been maintained at 10 pence. If charges are to be applied they could be applied consistently district wide and therefore it is recommended that a charging mechanism or turnstile is fitted to the outer door at New Street and charges introduced. If this is agreed, options to reconfigure this facility will also be considered to bring the disabled facility within the main toilet facility.
- 3.6. Based on the high cost of service provision set out in Appendix B, it would be beneficial if the level of service subsidy could be reduced. It is therefore recommended that Members consider increasing charges to 20 pence per use.

Maintenance and running costs

- 3.7. The Council has invested £806,350 in refurbishing public toilet in the last 10 years. Expenditure on maintenance, repairs and improvements varies annually but since 2003, the Council has spent approximately £335,580, an average of £33,558 a year. In addition £17,201 has been spent on statutory compliance testing and maintenance (i.e. electrical testing and maintenance of pumping station at the Guildenford facilities). The average annual total maintenance cost per set of facilities is therefore £2714. The

longer the period since refurbishment the higher the annual maintenance costs are likely to be as structures deteriorate.

- 3.8. Electricity costs vary by site but average £354 per facility, per annum. As light sensors are only fitted in some facilities electricity usage does not necessarily reflect facility usage at each site – some may have lights on constantly even though they receive limited use.
- 3.9. Water usage costs an average of £443 per facility, per year, some but not all facilities are metered so again water costs do not necessarily reflect usage.
- 3.10. Vandalism of Public conveniences has resulted in insurance claims totalling £6135 in the last 3 years. Costs of vandalism have exceeded this but not all incidents have been subject to insurance claims. The bulk of these problems have been in Eynsham with costs of £1569 for the Oxford Road facilities and £1975 for the Back lane facilities, mainly associated with vandalism to coin boxes or theft of lead.
- 3.11. Where facilities are leased; Chipping Norton Town Hall, Oxford Road, Eynsham, Charlbury and Bampton, lease costs have been factored into overall facility costs in Appendix B however lease costs are very low, with three attracting a peppercorn rent and Bampton costing £250 per year.
- 3.12. The total average cost of providing the service taking into account the annualised one-off capital costs for refurbishment as well as on going revenue costs is £50,436/year per facility. Appendix B does not include refurbishment costs.
- 3.13. Closure of all the facilities would save the Council an annualised sum of £219,411 including overheads per year in addition to saving revenue expenditure on planned and reactive maintenance and capital expenditure on periodic refurbishment.

Usage and cost comparison

- 3.14. The income received is not equally spread across the facilities; Appendix B shows the calculated cost to the cost per use at each facility. Maintenance costs have not been factored into this table as they are so variable.
- 3.15. This table shows that due to low usage in some areas, the comparative costs of some facilities are disproportionately high. Based on this data a recommendation is made that one of the Eynsham facilities is closed, as cost per use is currently £11.80. Usage is not sufficient to sustain two sets of facilities. Closure of one facility would reduce revenue costs by £15,000 thereby halving the cost per use. Capital costs for future refurbishment would also be saved - £26,903 was spent refurbishing the Oxford Road facilities in 2003. Whilst there is no site specific income data to compare usage at each Eynsham site, expenditure on consumables (soap, toilet paper, cleaning materials etc.) indicates that the Back Lane facilities receive more than three times the use of the Oxford Road facilities. WODC owns the Back lane facilities whereas the Oxford Road facilities are leased from the Parish Council, who also own the Sports pavilion (which has toilet facilities for Pavilion users). As both sets of facilities have been subject to repeated vandalism/theft, the Police have requested earlier closing to discourage anti-social behaviour. The recommendation is therefore that WODC close the Oxford Road facilities, however it is proposed that the Council consults Eynsham Parish Council in deciding which facility to close and considers the closure of both existing facilities and the provision of one central facility if this is feasible.

- 3.16. Under the Healthmatic Public Convenience Cleaning Framework; the Council only needs to give one calendar months' notice, in writing, to cease the service at a site.
- 3.17. Members may also wish to use this usage and cost model to inform future decisions on continued toilet provision. This information could also be used to form the basis of a policy for additional toilet provision, with business cases required to identify estimated demand against costs and income projections.
- 3.18. Appendix C sets out estimated costs/savings in delivering the recommendations.

Future Provision

- 3.19. Provision of public conveniences is a discretionary service and whilst it is acknowledged as a service valued by some members of the public, the Council may need to consider in the future whether it can continue to fund the provision of these facilities as budgets become under further pressure.
- 3.20. There is a national trend towards closing all or some of public toilet facilities or in some cases transferring those facilities to Town or Parish Councils. The British Toilet Association estimates that 40% of local authority toilets have closed in the past 10 years. Appendix D provides brief information on some recent decisions taken by other local authorities to close facilities.
- 3.21. The Council currently has no policy regarding future service provision or setting out how it deals with requests for additional public toilet provision. In essence the Cabinet could decide to:
 - Option A - Maintain existing discretionary provision of public conveniences but do not provide or operate any additional toilet facilities and
 - Refer any requests for additional facilities to the Town or Parish Councils
 - Provide Community Facilities Grant to fund community provision of public conveniences
 - Consider facilitating alternatives such as the Community Toilet Scheme
 - Option B - Maintain existing discretionary provision of public conveniences and provide and operate additional facilities on request where certain criteria are met: i.e. demand established and evidenced by Town or Parish Council, suitable site identified, and external funding agreed.
- 3.22. If Option A is adopted it may be that additional community facilities can still be provided with no financial demand on the Council. For example it may be that the construction of new facilities could be funded by a developer through Section 106 money and that on-going revenue costs could be funded by the Town or Parish or another income stream.
- 3.23. In Option B where additional facilities are provided Members would need to accept the budget growth that would result and may need to consider where other service budgets can be cut. It may be a partnership arrangement could be reached with WODC funding capital works and the Town or parish Council assuming responsibility for the on-going revenue costs of maintaining and cleaning the facilities.
- 3.24. The cost of Option B cannot be calculated as requests for additional facilities are difficult to predict however, the construction of 3 cubicles in a stand-alone building is in the region of £140,000, fitting 3 cubicles within an existing building is £95,000 and

annual revenue costs per set of 3 cubicles is approximately £17,800. These figures do not include project management/design costs or lease and freehold purchase costs of buildings or land required to provide the facilities.

Facility Type

3.25. The facilities provided currently vary from site to site; whilst this is not uncommon in public toilet provision the Council should where possible seek to achieve consistency in terms of service provision, charges and standards.

Urinals

3.26. In 2004 the Council undertook a refurbishment programme to modernise its public conveniences and bring them up to a high standard. The works were carried out in accordance with relevant legislation at the time; the Public Health Act (1936 S87) which stated that the Council could only charge for sit-down public conveniences and not urinals. It was only after the refurbishment programme had been completed, that the Public Health Act was updated which now allows the Council to charge for urinals.

3.27. All the sit-down public conveniences are now charged-for, with the exception of New Street, Chipping Norton where a charging mechanism has not yet been installed due to the high costs associated with the installation of a charging mechanism at this location.

3.28. As a result of some complaints, press interest and a petition (never formally submitted) relating to the fact that a charge is applied to cubicles but not urinals, consideration of a policy on urinal provision has been incorporated into this service review. The Council are able to take a decision whether it should continue to provide urinals and if so, whether charges should be applied.

3.29. Urinals are provided at 4 sites, key issues are:

- The layout and design of the buildings housing the urinals makes the introduction of a charging mechanism challenging, with the exception of the New Street facilities which could have a charging mechanism fitted on the outer door, allowing urinals to be charged for.
- Water usage for urinals is particularly high
- Urinals sometimes suffer misuse, with them being used for all toileting needs, rather than the appropriate use of a cubicle when required. This is a problem experienced periodically in some WODC urinals.
- No specific data is available on the number of uses the urinals receive however the data on usage of cubicles is indicative of demand at the sites.

3.30. Based on the above and analysis of cubicle usage data contained in appendix C, a policy recommendation is being made that the Council either accepts the current service provision, agrees to remove or replace urinals with cubicles when existing urinals reach their end of life or implements changes now; adopting a policy that all urinals will be removed and replaced with cubicles where demand requires. If there is a wish to change the service the following would be proposed:

- urinals in Charlbury, Witney, Langdale Gate and Chipping Norton, New Street, are removed but not replaced with cubicles, as cubicles already on site should meet demands.

- urinals in Chipping Norton, Town Hall are removed and replaced with one additional cubicle.
- 3.31. The removal of urinals and replacement with charged for cubicles should generate an estimated increase in income of £3,000 per annum across all facilities due to the switch to charged for cubicles. However, the cost of this service change is around £22,000 with little or no benefit to the public. Whilst it would ensure a charging policy where all users pay, the change would simply mean some that do not pay now would be subject to charges. There is therefore no sound business case for making immediate changes to this service.

Baby Changing Facilities

- 3.32. Some but not all of the Councils facilities provide baby changing facilities. Historically, some units have been removed and not replaced following repeated vandalism. It should be noted that baby straps are frequently burnt off and replaced. It is recommended that Baby changing units are installed in all facilities to achieve greater service consistency. The cost of installing these units is relatively low and research will be undertaken to ensure new units are as resistant to vandalism as possible. However, if changing units are vandalised the Council will need to decide on a case by case basis whether replacement is justified. Continual replacement, with units repeatedly subjected to vandalism cannot be justified due to the cost involved.

Disabled access

- 3.33. Disabled access is provided at all facilities and all are compliant with legislative requirements (Disability Discrimination Act 1995). Radar locks are not, however provided at all sites. It is recommended that Radar locks are fitted at all sites possible to the disabled cubicles.

Facility condition

- 3.34. Where the Council owns the freehold interest in the buildings housing toilet facilities, planned and reactive maintenance is carried out to achieve suitable standards. Maintenance is already planned to replace toilet doors at Bampton and undertake cosmetic improvements and minor roof repairs at other sites. No additional improvements have been identified as part of this review.
- 3.35. Where the Council holds a leasehold interest without structural repairing obligations, there have been problems with the condition of facilities and the failure of Chipping Norton Town Council to adequately maintain facilities and prevent water ingress led to the closure of toilets in October/November 2013.

Opening Hours

- 3.36. All facilities are open 07.30 – 19.30 during the winter and 07.30 – 22.00 during the summer (summertime opening hours operate 1st April to September 30th inclusive). All toilets are open on Christmas day but are not cleaned and are little used.
- 3.37. Toilets have automatic locking systems which secure them at their closing times, as soon as the cubicles are vacated.
- 3.38. Certain facilities have suffered both historical and on-going problems with anti-social behaviour, the Police recently requested closure of Eynsham facilities at 5.00pm to deter anti-social behaviour. There have also been on-going problems with the toilets at Chipping Norton, being used by those abusing substances and with anti-social behaviour

particularly with youths congregating after dark at The Leys, Witney, Browns Lane, Woodstock and Spendlove, Charlbury.

- 3.39. The right balance needs to be achieved between serving the public need to access facilities and preventing anti-social behaviour which may threaten other users or those living nearby and result in damage to facilities. The outlying units suffer the most vandalism and other anti-social behaviour during the evenings with the greatest problems at Oxford Rd, Eynsham and New St. Chipping Norton.
- 3.40. Once workers, shoppers and tourists have left towns and villages (predominantly by 6 pm) then most users will be those visiting pubs or restaurants, all of which will have their own toilet facilities. Usage after 19:30 in the summer is minimal - less than 3 % of the total daily usage and then only in the main centres such as Chipping Norton, Witney and Burford.
- 3.41. There are currently no public toilets open after 22.00 to cater for those leaving pubs when they close and very few problems with urinating in the street have been reported. It should be noted that provision of toilets does not eliminate problems with public urination.
- 3.42. As a comparison, public toilets within Cotswold District which has a similar mix of market towns and villages and a comparable night-time economy close at 6 pm in the Winter and either 7 pm or 9pm in the Summer. These shorter opening hours have not resulted in any increase in complaints or reported urination in public.
- 3.43. Reducing opening times would achieve the following:
 - Reduce likelihood of vandalism and therefore repair costs and inconvenience of facility closures
 - Reduce opportunity for anti-social behaviour or crime
 - Reduction in utility costs – to light and heat facilities which are little used.
 - Less chance of an accident due to low lighting during late cleaning
 - Less chance of rough sleeping in the toilets overnight – as they can be checked at lock down if closed earlier.
 - Consistency of Summer/Winter opening times
- 3.44. Utility costs for facilities total around £104,000/year. Whilst usage after 19.30 is only 3% of the total usage, reducing opening hours to closure at 19.30 (a reduction in hours of 17%) is estimated to reduce utility costs by 3 – 17% for 6 months of the year (summer period). Estimated saving is therefore £1500 - £8500 annually. A median figure of £5,000 has therefore been used for saving estimates.
- 3.45. Appendix E provides benchmarking data which includes toilet opening times in other Oxfordshire authorities. The nature of the night time economy in each location should be borne in mind when considering this data.
- 3.46. If Members agree to reduce opening times to closure at 19:30 then it is recommended these changes are embedded within the new contract which would commence from September 2014. The existing contract was tendered based on existing opening hours and they have indicated that a reduction in opening hours would not reduce contract costs at this stage.

- 3.47. The impact of the reduction in opening hours would be reviewed after 12 months. If significant problems were experienced as a result of earlier closure then opening hours could be extended again.

Sustainability – Reducing the Environmental Impact

- 3.48. The Council is currently finalising a new Low Carbon and Environmental Plan which supersedes the 2008 – 2012 Climate Change Policy. The Plan sets out the Council's strategic plans to reduce carbon emissions from its own estate and operations.
- 3.49. WODC is a signatory to Climate Local Oxfordshire which commits all local authorities in Oxfordshire to reduce carbon emissions and manage climate impacts including achieving a 3% annual reduction in CO₂ emissions from the local authority estate and operations (against a 2010/11 baseline). In 2012, 15% of the Council's total Carbon emissions of 3,386t CO₂, were from its corporate buildings, which include public conveniences.
- 3.50. Public conveniences, and particularly urinals, use relatively high volumes of water, require lighting and heating even when they are little used and therefore have an impact on carbon emissions from the Council's operations. Some but not all the facilities have movement activated light sensors fitted and work has previously been carried out to lag pipe work however more could be done to reduce water and electric usage.
- 3.51. The vandalism risk for any improvements such as solar panels would need to be considered.
- 3.52. It is therefore recommended that a project be commenced to prepare a business case for environmental improvements to the Council's public conveniences to reduce carbon emissions and service costs. This could consider such measures as rainwater harvesting, and installation of solar panels. If the project results in improvements to energy and water consumption, the Council can demonstrate clear leadership in tackling climate change

4. ALTERNATIVES/OPTIONS

- 4.1. The Council could continue with existing service provision and make no changes or select only some recommendations where changes improve customer service and achieve a payback on investment within a short period of time.
- 4.2. Recommendation 2.3 sets out the options for decision on urinal provision to either maintain existing services, remove urinals when they reach their end of life and replace with cubicles or remove urinals now.
- 4.3. Paragraph 3.21 sets out options for adopting a policy on future provision of additional facilities – the Council could also choose to take no action and not adopt a policy on this issue – this will however result in a lack of clarity, and result in future requests for additional facilities being considered individually which would have resource implications.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1. The total cost of service changes set out in Appendix C is estimated at £18,050 however quotes will need to be obtained. Cabinet are therefore asked to agree Capital funding up to £25,000 to allow some contingency, without the requirement to return to Cabinet. Expenditure would be agreed by the Head of Service in consultation with the Strategic Director and Portfolio Holder. Based on the estimated costs and savings the payback period if all the recommendations are delivered is less than seven months.

- 5.2. Subject to the policy decision made regarding provision of urinals additional capital may need to be allocated (see Appendix C):
- If recommendation c (i) is selected, there is no financial implication.
 - If recommendation c (ii) is selected, future replacement costs will need to be built into the Council's maintenance plan.
 - If recommendation c (iii) is selected additional capital of £27,000 (£22,000 estimated cost plus £5,000 contingency sum) needs to be allocated by Cabinet.

6. RISKS

- 6.1. An increase in charges or reduction in service provision could result in negative public relations.
- 6.2. Without implementation of measures set out in this report to reduce service costs, service costs will continue to escalate (particularly as utility costs rise) placing pressure on the Council's budgets.
- 6.3. Maintaining the charging discrepancy for cubicles and urinals could result in further negative public relations.

7. REASONS

The proposals within this report contribute to the council's objectives:

- To protect and enhance the environment of West Oxfordshire and maintain the District as a clean, beautiful place with low levels of crime and nuisance.
- To work in partnership to sustain vibrant, healthy and economically prosperous towns and villages with full employment
- To be recognised as a leading council that provides efficient, value for money services.

Claire Locke
Head of Environment and Commercial Services

(Author: Claire Locke, Tel: (01993) 861344; EMail: claire.locke@westoxon.gov.uk)
Date: 6 March, 2014

Background Papers:

None

Appendix A
Table showing existing WODC facilities & charges

Facility Location	Number of Cubicles /Urinals	Charge for Cubicles (10p)	Urinals provided	Baby changing provided
Town Hall, Market Square, Bampton, OX18 2JH	1 disabled* cubicle, 1 unisex cubicle	✓	X	X
High Street, Burford, OX18 4SE (Next to the Visitor Information Centre)	1 disabled* cubicle, 2 unisex cubicles	✓	X	✓
Guilford Car Park, Burford, OX18 4SE	1 disabled* cubicle, 2 unisex cubicles	✓	X	X
Black Bourton Road, Carterton, OX18 3DN	1 male cubicle, 1 female cubicle	✓	X	X
Spendlove Centre, Enstone Road, Charlbury, OX7 3PQ	2 urinals, 1 disabled* cubicle, 2 unisex cubicles	✓	✓	✓
Town Hall, Market Place, Chipping Norton, OX7 5DD	1 urinal (trough), 1 disabled* cubicle, 1 male & 1 female cubicle	✓	✓	✓
New Street Car Park, Chipping Norton, OX7 5LJ	3 urinals, 2 male and 3 female Cubicles	X	✓	✓
Back Lane Car Park, Eynsham, OX29 4QP	1 disabled* cubicle, 1 unisex cubicle	✓	X	X
Oxford Road Playing Fields, Eynsham, OX29 4DA	1 disabled* cubicle, 1 unisex cubicle	✓	X	X
Langdale Gate, Witney, OX28 6EY	1 disabled* cubicle, 2 urinals 3 unisex Cubicles	✓	✓	✓
The Leys, Witney, OX28 4AR	1 disabled* cubicle, 1 unisex cubicle	✓	X	X
Browns Lane, Woodstock, OX20 1ST	1 disabled* cubicle, 2 unisex cubicles	✓	X	✓
Hensington Road Car Park, Woodstock, OX20 1JQ	1 disabled* cubicle	✓	X	X

***Note: All disabled cubicles are unisex**

Facilities are also provided to the public at the following locations however the Council has no role in their provision or management:

Location	Provision
Marriott's – Welch Way Witney	Public Conveniences are owned by the development which at present is Reef Witney Ltd.
Town Centre Shop, Witney	Disabled toilet within customer services - for customers & staff only.
The Guildhall, Witney	Disabled toilet within customer services - for customers & staff only.
Langdale Hall, Witney	Public conveniences for customer use only (controlled access by Witney Town Council)
The Corn Exchange, Witney	Public conveniences for customer use only (controlled access by Witney Town Council)
Witney Town Council Hall	Public conveniences for customer use only (controlled access by Witney Town Council)
Chipping Norton Town Hall	Public conveniences for customer use only (controlled access by Witney Town Council)
All other Town/Parish Councils	only have provision for their staff and visitors to their town hall/offices all as required under DDA regulations

It is only the facilities at the Marriot's that are open to all members of the public. The remainder of the facilities are offered for customers or users of the facilities with many controlled by key access preventing people coming in just to use toilet facilities.

Appendix B - Table showing cost, income and usage data per facility for 2012/13.

Facility location	Facility specific cost	Total cost inc. proportion of overheads	Facility income	Assumed number of uses*	Net Cost per use
Bampton, Town Hall	£10,778	£16,304	£479.30	4793	£3.30
Burford High street	£12,891	£18417	£3313.60	33136	£0.46
Carterton, Black Bourton Rd	£10,015	£15,541	£1128.60	11286	£1.28
Charlbury, Browns Lane	£11,587	£17,113	£589.20	5892 No data on urinal usage	£2.80
Chipping Norton, New Street	£12,393	£17,919	No Charge	Not known	Not Known
Chipping Norton, Town Hall	£13,656	£19,182	£1037.80	10378 No data on urinal usage	£1.74
Eynsham, Back Lane *See note 1	£9,935	£15,461	£255	2550	£11.80
Eynsham, Oxford Road*See note 1	£9,095	£14,621			
Witney – The Leys	£11,526	£17,052	£439.80	4398	£3.78
Witney –Langdale Gate	£11,657	£17,183	£1291.20	12912 No data on urinal usage	£1.23
Woodstock – Browns lane	£11,963	£17,489	£510.80	5108	£3.32
Woodstock - Hensington	£9,843	£15,369	£574.60	5746	£2.57
Burford - Guildenford	£12,234	£17,760	£1986.30	19863	£0.79
Total figures all WODC facilities	£147,573	£219,411	£11,606.20	116,062	N/A
Average figures for a WODC facility cost/income	£11,351	£16,878	£967.18 (£892.78 if free facilities included)	8928	£1.79
Comparative figure for CDC – total cost/income all facilities			£68,785	492,208	£0.66 average

Note 1: Eynsham facilities – the costs for the Back Lane and Oxford Road facilities can be identified separately but the income has historically been counted together so we have no way of determining income or usage at the separate facilities.

No data is available on the actual number of times the toilets are used – usage has been calculated based on the income but this does not account for door holding, where one customer holds the door open for the next thereby avoiding the need to pay.

CDC has 16 sets of facilities, following the transfer of one set of facilities to Blockley Parish Council in 2012. Ten of the 16 facilities currently have a 20 pence per use charge applied, the remainder are

Appendix C - Financial implications of delivering recommendations:

Rec.	Recommendation Description	Works Description	One-off Capital Cost	Annual Revenue saving/ income
2.1	Adopts policy option A – no additional toilet provision	None	£0	£0
2.2	6 baby changing units	Installation of units Minimal on-going cost for repair/replacement	£1500	£0
2.3	Install radar lock at Browns Lane, Woodstock	Install radar lock	£450	£0
2.5	Closure of one Eynsham facility	One off capital to remove and clear facilities	£10,000	£9,100 excluding overheads & maintenance
2.6	Prepare business case for energy and water saving improvements	This work can be delivered in house so there are no costs. The business case itself will present costs and benefits of potential energy and water saving measures.	£0	Savings – not quantifiable until business case complete.
2.7	Increase charges to 20p	Amend charging policy & budgets. Changes to signage (£4.10 + vat per sign)	£100	£10,000
2.8	Apply charges at all facilities	Installation of charging mechanisms at New Street car park Chipping Norton	£6000	£1200
2.9	Reduce opening hours	Inform public & contractor	£0	£5000 utility savings Potential reduction in vandalism – not possible to value.
Overall cost/savings			£18,050	£25,300

Policy options for Urinal/Cubicle provision

Rec.	Recommendation description	Works Description	One-off capital cost	Annual revenue saving/income
2.4 (a)	No change to current service	None	£0	£0
2.4 (b)	Remove/Replace urinals at end of life with cubicles	See 2.4 © below, however cost of replacing urinals with new urinals deducted; To clear Charlbury Lane & New St. To replace urinal with cubicle – Town Hall - Langdale	£2500 £13,000 £2500	£1000 Water saving £3,000 additional income from charged for cubicles
Sub-total for Option 2.4 (b) – Payback 4.5 years			£18,000	£4,000
2.4(c)	Urinals in Chipping Norton, Town Hall and Witney, Langdale Gate, are removed and replaced with one additional cubicle at each site. Urinals in Charlbury, Browns Lane and Chipping Norton, New Street, are removed areas made good	One off capital to remove and clear facilities/install new cubicles To clear Charlbury Lane & New Street To reinstate with cubicle – Town Hall - Langdale Increase in income as men switch to use of charged for cubicle	£2500 £15,000 £4500	£1000 Water saving £3,000 additional income from charged for cubicles
Sub-total for Option 2.4 (c) – Payback 5.5 years			£22,000	£4,000

Appendix D

Table showing Case studies illustrating changes in public toilet provision

The following is not an exhaustive list but provides some brief case studies of the different approaches taken in 2013 by some councils in closing or transferring facilities:

	Action	Justification	Alternatives
Vale of White Horse	Feb 2013 - Two facilities closed in the last year, remaining 8 considered for closure in February however decision then taken by Members to invest in improvements/replacement and not close facilities	Initially closure was planned to save £110,000. There was public concern voiced to closure plans, plans to invest in facilities were then announced.	N/A
Cornwall	2013 - Closure of 31 facilities & transfer of 109 to Town and Parish Councils (with total £600 revenue allocation to support transition in year 1 and £850,000 capital investment in improving facilities prior to transfer, transfer of freehold in many cases) 74 retained by Cornwall Council in 2013	£750,000 savings target	Community toilet scheme where public can use facilities in shops, cafes etc.
Dorset	July 2013 - Transfer of facilities in Studland to Parish Council	Council to financially support the Parish Council, in the form of three staged payments based on 75%, 50% and 25% of the running Costs which equates to £12,144 in total and transfer of land & building assets valued at £192,380	Transfer to Parish Council
Teignbridge	Sept 2013 - Consultation with Town and parishes commenced – option to take on facilities to save them from closure. Currently in consultation phase so outcome not yet known.	Need to reduce spending due financial pressures. Transfer in the spirit of localism.	Potential transfer to Town and Parish Councils
Bath& North East Somerset	Sept 2013 - Plans to close of 6 out of 27 facilities were reconsidered in September due to public pressure, campaigns and a petition – final decision not yet made.	Target of £120,000 annual saving	Not yet known
Portsmouth City Council	October 2013 - 12 of 25 facilities being closed by 31 October to save £200K from a £540,000 budget. Of the retained facilities 2 will have a 20p charge applied.	Decision was following a public consultation, EIA and comprehensive decision process	Community toilet scheme
Torbay	August 2013 - Opening hours reduced to achieve savings	Part of Corporate savings plan of £500,000	None
Isle of Wight Council	June 2013 - New administration have pledged to reopen toilets closed to save money under previous administration	Funding has yet to be identified to enable this 'Pledge' to be delivered	N/A

Appendix E

Benchmarking data on toilet provision, charges and opening times in Oxfordshire authorities

Authority	Number of facilities/sites	Charges applied	Opening hours
West Oxfordshire	13 facilities	10p at all but one site	Summer 7.30 – 22.00 Winter 7.30 – 19.30
Vale of White Horse	6 facilities plus 4 Superloos in Abingdon, Grove and Wantage	20p charge for Superloos	Vary weekday and weekend longest is 8.00 – 18.30 Mon – Saturday and 9.00 – 17.00 on a Sunday. 2 facilities only open during the summer although superloos open 24 hours in Wantage, Grove & Abingdon
South Oxfordshire	11 facilities (one closed long term due to vandalism)	1 facility has a 10p charge applied	7 facilities open 24 hours 1 facility open summer only but then open 24 hours Remainder open 8.00 – 19.30
Oxford City	24 public facilities Community toilets* also listed on website	Free	Majority of facilities open 9.00 – 17.00, with city centre facilities providing one overnight (24hr) cubicle.
Cherwell	6 facilities	10p charge	Open 6.00 – 19.00 with one overnight (24 hour) cubicle at each location

*Community toilets are those provided by businesses i.e. cafes, public houses etc. For more information on this scheme please see: <http://www.oxford.gov.uk/PageRender/decEH/CommunityToilets.htm>

Please note: most authorities no longer provide urinals. South Oxfordshire do however and these are provided free of charge.